Consultation proposal by Glasgow City Council

Report by Education Scotland, addressing educational aspects of the proposal to construct a new build Broomhill Primary School on the site of the existing main building of Broomhill Primary School, and to relocate the children and staff based in the existing annexe building into the new build Broomhill Primary School.

Context

This report from Education Scotland is required under the terms of the *Schools* (*Consultation*) (*Scotland*) *Act 2010*. It has been prepared by HM Inspectors in accordance with the terms of the Act. The purpose of this report is to provide an independent and impartial consideration of the council's consultation proposal. Section 2 of this report sets out the views expressed by consultees during the initial consultation process. Section 3 sets out HM Inspectors' consideration of the educational aspects of the proposal and the views expressed by consultees. Section 4 summarises HM Inspectors' overall view of the proposal. Upon receipt of this report, the Act requires the council to consider it and then prepare its final consultation report. The council's final consultation report should include a copy of this report and must contain an explanation of how it has reviewed the initial proposal, including a summary of points raised during the consultation and the council's response to them. The council has to publish its final consultation report three weeks before it takes its final decision.

1. Introduction

- 1.1 Glasgow City Council proposes to construct a new build Broomhill Primary School on the site of the existing main building of Broomhill Primary School, and to relocate the children and staff based in the existing annexe building into the new build Broomhill Primary School.
- 1.2 If the proposal is approved, the current main building of Broomhill Primary would be demolished and replaced with a new building. During the demolition and construction phases, it would be necessary for staff and children who are based in the main building to be decanted to the former Ladywell Primary School. The annexe building would remain in use during the demolition and construction phases.
- 1.3 The report from Education Scotland is required under the terms of the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010.* It has been prepared by HM Inspectors in accordance with the terms of the Act.
- 1.4 HM Inspectors undertook the following activities in considering the educational aspects of the proposal:
- attendance at the public meeting held on 25 March 2014 in connection with the council's proposals;
- consideration of all relevant documentation provided by the council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related

- consultation documents, written and oral submissions from parents and others; and
- visits to the sites of Broomhill Primary School main building and annexe, including discussion with relevant consultees.
- 1.5 HM Inspectors considered:
- the likely effects of the proposal for children of the school; any other users;
 children likely to become pupils within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper; and other children and young people in the council area;
- any other likely effects of the proposal;
- how the council intends to minimise or avoid any adverse effects that may arise from the proposal;
- benefits which the council believes will result from implementation of the proposal, and the council's reasons for coming to these beliefs; and
- consideration of further representations made directly to Education Scotland on relevant educational aspects of the proposal.

2. Consultation process

- 2.1 Glasgow City Council undertook the initial consultation on its proposals with reference to the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010.*
- 2.2 The senior managers and staff of Broomhill Primary School are extremely positive about the proposal. They are keen to work in a modern, purpose-built school with improved facilities. They acknowledge the potential benefits of working more closely as a whole-school team and look forward to improved opportunities for professional learning, such as sharing more easily their skills and expertise. They are also keen to make sure that the proposed new school building is designed to make the most of creative approaches to learning and teaching.
- 2.3 Almost all children in Broomhill Primary School are very pleased with the proposal. They are excited about having a new school and look forward to having the whole school community together on one site. Older children feel that this will provide them with more opportunities to develop and apply important leadership skills, such as acting as buddies, monitors and role models for younger ones. Children are also looking forward to learning in more modern classrooms, playing sports on the all-weather, multi-use games area, accessing up-to-date technology and computer equipment and having nicer toilets.
- 2.4 Parents and carers of children who attend Broomhill Primary School are very positive overall about the proposal. Almost all who responded to the consultation feel that their children will benefit from a wider range of modern facilities that will be available in the new school. There are a number of issues that parents would like more information about. They acknowledge that during the construction of the new

school, children at P5 to P7, who are based currently in the main building, will be required to decant to the former Ladywell Primary School. Parents would like more detailed information about the proposed decant arrangements and want reassurance from the council that their children's educational experiences will not be diminished during the decant period. They would also like more information about the operational running of the school when the whole-school community moves into the new building. This includes how intervals, lunch breaks and after-school clubs will be organised and the arrangements for traffic management, given that all children will arrive at and leave school each day from one access point. Many parents are concerned about the arrangements for Broomhill Out of School Care Association (BOSCA), who currently operate a before and after-school care service for children in the school.

- 2.5 BOSCA expressed concerns about the future of their service. They are currently housed in a free standing building in the grounds where the annexe is situated. Children also access the annexe school building on a frequent basis during before and after-school care. Following the public meeting on 25 March 2014, the council held a further public meeting with the school's Parent Council in order to discuss in more detail the requirements of before and after-school care in relation to the plans for the new school building.
- 2.6 Local residents and community council members who responded to the consultation are broadly in favour of the proposal. Many feel that the children in Broomhill Primary School deserve a more modern environment for learning than they experience currently. The majority of local residents expressed concerns about the proposed design of the new building. They feel that it was not in keeping with the existing residential area. Should the proposal go ahead, local residents and community council members would like clarification from the council on what will happen to the current site of the annexe building.

3. Educational aspects of the proposal

- 3.1 The council's statement on the educational benefits of this proposal is clear. It makes a strong case for the likely positive gains for children, staff and the broader community. The council sets out clearly its assessment of the likely effects of the proposal. This includes appropriate reference to children, staff, other users of the school and other pupils in the area. The statement also includes an analysis of other likely effects of the proposal.
- 3.2 The proposal is of clear educational benefit. Both the current main school building and the annexe are in a poor state of repair. Staff and children alike feel that the current accommodation which is split over two sites inhibits a true sense of school community and limits opportunities for high-quality learning and teaching. The new building will offer modern, high-quality accommodation with the potential for greater flexibility of use. This will be more appropriate for more dynamic learning and teaching and will allow children the opportunity to develop fully the capacities within Curriculum for Excellence. It will offer staff and children better facilities internally, including provision of flexible learning space and better facilities in the immediate outdoor environment.

- 3.3 The new school will be designed and managed to optimise community use and provide new and improved facilities for the local community out with school hours. This offers the additional advantage of providing improved accommodation for community use, as well as for the use of children when at school. The new school grounds will include a multi-use games area which would be available for community use out with school hours.
- 3.4 Staff feel that aspects of the proposed layout of the new school could be improved, in order to make the very best use of the space available for dynamic learning and teaching. Senior managers and staff would welcome being involved in further discussions about the design of proposed school, traffic management plans and the landscaping of the outdoor space. Glasgow City Council has yet to finalise the design and layout of the new building. They should continue with their plans to engage further with staff, should the proposal go ahead.
- 3.5 The Board and management of BOSCA feel that in order to continue to provide the level and quality of service that they currently offer, that there should be appropriate provision for their service at the new school building. The council should continue to involve parents and BOSCA in discussions about the provision for before and after-school care.
- 3.6 The likely effects on children who will become pupils within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper are similar in nature to those identified above. The improved accommodation and facilities will offer a very appropriate environment for high quality learning and teaching in the early stages. This will also allow for active and cooperative learning. Children will also benefit from the whole-school community being located within one building, removing the current challenge that faces children at the end of P4 in having to make the significant transition from the annexe building to the main school.
- 3.7 There is a potential risk created by an increase in traffic due to the relocation of the current split site accommodation to one building. The council needs to consider the implications of the increased demand for parking and the increased volume of traffic around the school, particularly at the beginning and end of the school day.

4. Summary

The council presents a strong case for this proposal. Implementation of Glasgow City Council's proposal is likely to be of significant educational benefit to the children of Broomhill Primary School. Provision of a new school will overcome the limitations of the current, split site accommodation. The new building will offer modern, high quality accommodation with the potential for greater flexibility of use. The proposal has the additional advantage of being of likely benefit to the community more generally. Overall, stakeholders were very positive in their response to the proposal. Should the proposal go ahead, the council should continue to involve all stakeholders in further discussions, including in the design of the building, arrangements for the decant process, the provision for out of school care, and in considering an effective traffic management system.

HM Inspectors Education Scotland June 2014